The eventual response to doubling pre-industrial atmospheric CO₂ likely would be a nearly ice-free planet, preceded by a period of chaotic change with continually changing shorelines.
Mitigation Strategies for Atmospheric Carbon

Clarence Lehman
Department of Ecology,
Evolution, and Behavior

Presented in this seminar October 14, 2008:
slide 22 of 55

*Coastlines after the bulk of the earth’s frozen freshwater thaws*
Humanity’s task of moderating human-caused global climate change is urgent. Ocean and ice sheet inertias provide a buffer delaying full response by centuries, but there is a danger that human-made forcings could drive the climate system beyond tipping points such that change proceeds out of our control.

The time available to reduce the human-made forcing is uncertain, because models of the global system and critical components such as ice sheets are inadequate.

What follows is the last two paragraphs of the Appendix (to the preprint) of this paper:

Climate models are another source of uncertainty in climate projections. Our present paper and our estimated target CO2 level do not rely on climate models, but rather are based on empirical evidence from past and ongoing climate change. However, the limited capability of models to simulate climate dynamics and interactions among climate system components makes it difficult to estimate the speed at which climate effects will occur and the degree to which human-induced effects will be masked by natural climate variability.

The recent rapid decline of Arctic ice [S47-S49] is a case in point, as it has been shown that model improvements of multiple physical processes will be needed for reliable simulation. The modeling task is made all the more difficult by likely connections of Arctic change with the stratosphere [S50] and with the global atmosphere and ocean [S51].

www.columbia.edu/~jeh1/2008/TargetCO2_20080407.pdf
However, climate response time is surely less than the atmospheric lifetime of the human-caused perturbation of CO$_2$. Thus remaining fossil fuel reserves should not be exploited without a plan for retrieval and disposal of resulting atmospheric CO$_2$.

Next, three slides: Fig(6), discussed in detail in Section 15 of the Supplementary Material, then Fig(S12) and Fig(S13).
CO$_2$ Emissions and Atmospheric Concentration with Coal Phaseout by 2030

Fig. (6). (a) Fossil fuel CO$_2$ emissions with coal phase-out by 2030 based on IPCC [2] and EIA [80] estimated fossil fuel reserves. (b) Resulting atmospheric CO$_2$ based on use of a dynamic-sink pulse response function representation of the Bern carbon cycle model [78, 79].
Fig. (S12). (a) Fossil fuel CO₂ emissions by fuel type [S32, S33], the thin green sliver being gas flaring plus cement production, and IPCC fossil fuel emissions scenarios, (b) expansion global emissions to show recent changes more precisely, the EIA values excluding CO₂ emissions from cement manufacture, (c) observed atmospheric CO₂ amount and IPCC and “alternative” scenarios for the future, (d) annual atmospheric CO₂ growth rates. Data here is an update of data sources defined in [6]. The yellow area is bounded by scenarios that are most extreme in the second half of the 21st century; other scenarios fall outside this range in the early part of the century.
Fig. (S13). Fossil fuel and land-use CO$_2$ emissions, and potential fossil fuel emissions. Historical fossil fuel emissions are from the Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center [CDIAC, S32] and British Petroleum [BP, S33]. Lower limits on oil and gas reserves are from IPCC [S34] and higher limits are from the United States Energy Information Administration [EIA, 80]. Lower limit for coal reserves is from the World Energy Council [WEC, S35] and upper limit from IPCC [S34]. Land use estimate is from integrated emissions of Houghton/2 (Fig. S14) supplemented to include pre-1850 and post-2000 emissions; uncertainty bar is subjective.
Paleoclimate evidence and ongoing global changes imply that today's CO$_2$, about 385 ppm, is already too high to maintain the climate to which humanity, wildlife, and the rest of the biosphere are adapted. Realization that we must reduce the current CO$_2$ amount has a bright side: effects that had begun to seem inevitable, including impacts of ocean acidification, loss of fresh water supplies, and shifting of climatic zones, may be averted by the necessity of finding an energy course beyond fossil fuels sooner than would otherwise have occurred.
Humanity today, collectively, must face the uncomfortable fact that industrial civilization itself has become the principal driver of global climate. If we stay our present course, using fossil fuels to feed a growing appetite for energy-intensive life styles, we will soon leave the climate of the Holocene, the world of prior human history. The eventual response to doubling pre-industrial atmospheric CO₂ likely would be a nearly ice-free planet, preceded by a period of chaotic change with continually changing shorelines.

Humanity’s task of moderating human-caused global climate change is urgent. Ocean and ice sheet inertias provide a buffer delaying full response by centuries, but there is a danger that human-made forcings could drive the climate system beyond tipping points such that change proceeds out of our control. The time available to reduce the human-made forcing is uncertain, because models of the global system and critical components such as ice sheets are inadequate. However, climate response time is surely less than the atmospheric lifetime of the human-caused perturbation of CO₂. Thus remaining fossil fuel reserves should not be exploited without a plan for retrieval and disposal of resulting atmospheric CO₂.

Paleoclimate evidence and ongoing global changes imply that today’s CO₂, about 385 ppm, is already too high to maintain the climate to which humanity, wildlife, and the rest of the biosphere are adapted. Realization that we must reduce the current CO₂ amount has a bright side: effects that had begun to seem inevitable, including impacts of ocean acidification, loss of fresh water supplies, and shifting of climatic zones, may be averted by the necessity of finding an energy course beyond fossil fuels sooner than would otherwise have occurred.
We suggest an initial objective of reducing atmospheric CO$_2$ to 350 ppm, with the target to be adjusted as scientific understanding and empirical evidence of climate effects accumulate. Although a case already could be made that the eventual target probably needs to be lower, the 350 ppm target is sufficient to qualitatively change the discussion and drive fundamental changes in energy policy.
Limited opportunities for reduction of non-CO$_2$ human-caused forcings are important to pursue but do not alter the initial 350 ppm CO$_2$ target. This target must be pursued on a timescale of decades, as paleoclimate and ongoing changes, and the ocean response time, suggest that it would be foolhardy to allow CO$_2$ to stay in the dangerous zone for centuries.
A practical global strategy almost surely requires a rising global price on CO₂ emissions and phase-out of coal use except for cases where the CO₂ is captured and sequestered.
The carbon price should eliminate use of unconventional fossil fuels, unless, as is unlikely, the CO₂ can be captured. A reward system for improved agricultural and forestry practices that sequester carbon could remove the current CO₂ overshoot. With simultaneous policies to reduce non-CO₂ greenhouse gases, it appears still feasible to avert catastrophic climate change.
Present policies, with continued construction of coal-fired power plants without CO$_2$ capture, suggest that decision-makers do not appreciate the gravity of the situation. We must begin to move now toward the era beyond fossil fuels. Continued growth of greenhouse gas emissions, for just another decade, practically eliminates the possibility of near-term return of atmospheric composition beneath the tipping level for catastrophic effects.
The most difficult task, phase-out over the next 20-25 years of coal use that does not capture CO$_2$, is Herculean, yet feasible when compared with the efforts that went into World War II. The stakes, for all life on the planet, surpass those of any previous crisis. The greatest danger is continued ignorance and denial, which could make tragic consequences unavoidable.
We suggest an initial objective of reducing atmospheric CO$_2$ to 350 ppm, with the target to be adjusted as scientific understanding and empirical evidence of climate effects accumulate. Although a case already could be made that the eventual target probably needs to be lower, the 350 ppm target is sufficient to qualitatively change the discussion and drive fundamental changes in energy policy. Limited opportunities for reduction of non-CO$_2$ human-caused forcings are important to pursue but do not alter the initial 350 ppm CO$_2$ target. This target must be pursued on a timescale of decades, as paleoclimate and ongoing changes, and the ocean response time, suggest that it would be foolhardy to allow CO$_2$ to stay in the dangerous zone for centuries.

A practical global strategy almost surely requires a rising global price on CO$_2$ emissions and phase-out of coal use except for cases where the CO$_2$ is captured and sequestered. The carbon price should eliminate use of unconventional fossil fuels, unless, as is unlikely, the CO$_2$ can be captured. A reward system for improved agricultural and forestry practices that sequester carbon could remove the current CO$_2$ overshoot. With simultaneous policies to reduce non-CO$_2$ greenhouse gases, it appears still feasible to avert catastrophic climate change.

Present policies, with continued construction of coal-fired power plants without CO$_2$ capture, suggest that decision-makers do not appreciate the gravity of the situation. We must begin to move now toward the era beyond fossil fuels. Continued growth of greenhouse gas emissions, for just another decade, practically eliminates the possibility of near-term return of atmospheric composition beneath the tipping level for catastrophic effects.

The most difficult task, phase-out over the next 20-25 years of coal use that does not capture CO$_2$, is Herculean, yet feasible when compared with the efforts that went into World War II. The stakes, for all life on the planet, surpass those of any previous crisis. The greatest danger is continued ignorance and denial, which could make tragic consequences unavoidable.